



**THE CENTER FOR RESEARCH LIBRARIES
COUNCIL OF VOTING MEMBERS**

**BUSINESS MEETING – APRIL 14, 2016
MINUTES
(Draft)**

The annual meeting of the Council of Voting Members of the Center for Research Libraries came to order at 10:00 am Thursday, April 14, 2016. The meeting was held at the University of Chicago's Gleacher Center in Chicago with Scott Waugh, Chair, Board of Directors, presiding. Present were Councilors, guests and staff as listed in Attachment A to these minutes.

CHAIR'S REPORT: Chair Scott Waugh welcomed and thanked participants for attending the business meeting. Mr. Waugh then introduced the Center's Board of Directors.

Mr. Waugh began his report on a sad note, marking the passing of Richard Fyffe, Grinnell College, and Dan Hazen, Harvard University, both devoted members of the Board of Directors and dedicated advocates of CRL. Richard and Dan passed away in 2015 year and, Mr. Waugh said, "we are very sorrowful for their passing."

Mr. Waugh noted that the theme of the FY 2016 annual report is "Transparency". Operationally for the Center for Research Libraries transparency means collecting, archiving, preserving, and making accessible precious resources of vital importance to research in the humanities and social sciences. The humanities and social sciences depend upon access to these kinds of resources to advance knowledge and understanding of the world. CRL's building and stewardship of those resources enable researchers to do the work that they are trained to do.

Mr. Waugh noted that research in turn opens to view the workings of governments, societies, cultures, and economies around the world, past and present. Today, he observed, you will hear that CRL continues to operate with fiscal prudence and careful husbanding of resources. It is an efficient organization, well managed and in a difficult economic environment has built up substantial reserves. What we propose to do over the next three years is to draw upon those reserves to make new investments in primary functions of CRL and to benefit to members in the areas of digitization, electronic delivery, and an enhanced internet presence. We want CRL to be a high-functioning, go-to site for researchers in the United States and around the world.

In the years to come CRL proposes to collaborate with funders and institutions around the world to undertake and better fulfill its core mission. Efforts to expand the membership and to diversify revenues will continue, recognizing that the world of libraries is changing rapidly. Higher education too is changing, and CRL must be nimble and innovative in order to ensure that its functions and services persist and are sustained into the future.

Finally, we plan to further improve service to members and to make the organization as effective as possible, reducing costs and making sure that the benefits enjoyed by so many scholars today and in the past remain available for those in the future.

Mr. Waugh's entire presentation can be found at [CRL Council of Voting Members](#).

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE 2015 MEETING: Thomas Burish, Secretary, submitted the Minutes of the April 24, 2015 annual meeting of the Council of Voting Members for approval. There being no correction or comments,

The Council of Voting Members Minutes of April 24, 2015 was approved as distributed. [MOVED: Mr. Wang; SECONDED: Councilor VOTED: unanimously.]

SECRETARY'S REPORT ON MEMBERSHIP: Secretary Burish explained that CRL receives the vast majority of its funding through membership fees. In recent years growth of the membership has been challenged, he said, by two primary factors: the economy, with many libraries facing cuts in their budgets and difficulty keeping pace with inflation. In Canada, where CRL has nineteen members, it is especially difficult because of the fall in the currency exchange rate against the U.S. dollar. Moreover, some librarians believe that the CRL collections are not used often enough to justify the continued investment, especially if dollars are hard to come by.

Mr. Burish noted that total membership for April 2016 was 219, with ten new members enrolled during the year: American University of Beirut (global member), Columbia College Chicago, Furman University, Hamilton College, Macalester College, New College of Florida, North Dakota State University, U.S. Military Academy West Point, University of West Florida, and Virginia Commonwealth University.

Mr. Burish reported that eight institutions will discontinue CRL membership on July 1. He identified the prospects that CRL management will pursue for membership in FY 2017: land-grant universities, mid-sized private universities, and elite four-year colleges. He also reported on plans to create new marketing materials, and to exhibit at the American Historical Association annual conference in January 2016 in Atlanta.

Lastly, Mr. Burish encouraged members to help spread the word about CRL and its benefits. Mr. Burish added that Mr. Reilly and his staff would be happy to provide information on prospective members, the history of CRL contacts with those institutions, and other useful background. He stressed that membership growth is an important issue for CRL, as member support determines the level and quality of services CRL can provide.

PRESIDENT'S REPORT: Bernard Reilly, President, reported on the state of the Center and on CRL priorities for the coming fiscal year. He acknowledged that 2016 is the ten year anniversary of the Technical Reports Archives Information Library (TRAIL), a project operating under the CRL umbrella, and cited the project as a model of cooperation in the preservation of government documents and technical reports.

Reilly also named the top users of CRL collections, and reported on CRL's licensing of databases in FY 2016.

Mr. Reilly then posed two questions to attendees:

1. *Is CRL's digital investment paying off?* Over the past ten years CRL has invested heavily in electronic access to primary source collections and data. Should we continue and, if so, at what level?
2. *Should more CRL digital resources be Open Access?* To what extent are members in favor of subsidizing digital access for libraries outside the CRL community?

A Councilor asked whether there is a "balance point," i.e., where investing to improve the discoverability of what is digitized might increase its value to the user, since it is obvious that CRL use would go up if more collections were exposed. Mr. Reilly acknowledged the importance of investing in discoverability of the collections, and that CRL is working with OCLC, ProQuest, and other providers of

discovery services to improve visibility of CRL records in their tools. He admitted that the collections are “not getting the use that we believe they should.”

A number of Councilors strongly encouraged removal of CRL’s restrictions on public domain materials digitized by CRL, which access is currently available only to researchers at member institutions. Although the move would enable a certain amount of free-riding by researchers at non-member institutions, the consensus of attendees was that lifting the restrictions would result in increased exposure and discoverability of CRL resources. Mr. Reilly affirmed that the Board would decide when to make this change, and would keep members informed as plans proceed.

Also, Mr. Reilly asked whether CRL should begin to merge selected serial titles with related holdings at the Linda Hall Library. He explained that CRL’s Global Resources STE Partnership with Linda Hall vastly expanded the number of journals available to CRL libraries, and that CRL is now poised to take the next step: strategic digitization and merging of historical titles. A Councilor asked whether merging implies necessarily transferring ownership. Mr. Reilly confirmed that ownership would be transferred to the Linda Hall Library, with the provision that Linda Hall is required to offer transferred materials back to CRL should they at some future time decide to take the materials out of service.

A Councilor asked about the cost of moving materials to Linda Hall. CRL vice president for collections and services James Simon explained that the total cost of the pilot is fairly low, less than \$15,000 plus the staff cost for paging the materials and cost of shipping. He said that CRL is taking advantage of overlapping holdings at Linda Hall for titles to be merged and digitized.

The Councilor asked whether the goal is to maximize space savings at CRL, on the premise that sending longer runs of material to LHL will make room for new collections. Or whether the goal is to maximize digitization of material at minimal cost to CRL. For now, Simon responded, CRL’s priority is the latter, drawing selected volumes from CRL holdings to fill gaps in the LHL collection. This saves CRL in terms of processing and shipping, he observed, but could create a “Swiss cheese” effect in CRL’s local holdings. Mr. Reilly added that the shipping cost is a negligible portion of CRL’s annual shipping budget.

Mr. Reilly reported that CRL will hold a referendum on the question, formally polling the membership by electronic means within the next month or so.

Then Mr. Reilly gave an overview of CRL, stating that what distinguishes CRL from research library associations like ARL, CARL, CLIR, and others is the collections facility, a major bricks-and-mortar capital asset built and maintained through several decades of member investment. In addition since 1949, member libraries have invested the expertise and knowledge of their staff in building unique and valuable collections from all world regions at CRL.

Mr. Reilly added that over fifty people work at CRL, plus part-time student assistants, and are doing the work that CRL staff have always done, and thirty percent more. CRL now does many things, such as collection analysis, licensing, and digitization of collections, which it was not doing fifteen years ago. Therefore CRL’s Board and management commend the staff for their hard work in keeping pace with an evolving library world and with rapidly changing scholarly practice.

In closing, Mr. Reilly thanked the Board of Director, especially the outgoing Board members, Susan Gibbons, Yale University, Susan Martin, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, and James Grossman, American Historical Association, for their work on CRL’s behalf. Finally, he stated that thanks is due to the member representatives, whose participation and the expertise, knowledge, skill, dedication and commitment of their staff enable CRL to achieve its goals.

Mr. Reilly’s presentation can be found at [CRL Council of Voting Members](#).

TREASURER’S REPORT: Treasurer Xuemao Wang covered several budget-related topics: the independent auditors’ report of CRL’s FY 2015 financial statements; the projected FY 2016 operating fund results; and the proposed budget for FY 2017.

Mr. Wang reported that FY 2015 ended with a negative change in net operating assets of \$377,078; the FY 2015 auditors’ report rendered a clean opinion, was quite positive and listed no significant concerns. The projected FY 2016 operating fund change in net assets is a negative \$500,677.

In presenting the budget proposal for FY 2017 Mr. Wang highlighted the proposed operating fund revenues and expenditures, which he said reflect continued investment in key areas, namely digitization of collections, licensing of databases, and collection analysis, to increase member benefits, while containing the cost of CRL to institutions. CRL proposes to draw for the third consecutive year upon a portion of the reserve funds generated between 2009 and 2014. Specifically CRL proposes to spend \$7,700,277 against projected revenues of \$6,841,450, drawing draw \$858,827 from its reserves for operating expenses. This is in line with the strategic commitment made by CRL’s Board in 2014 to increase high-value CRL services, develop new capabilities, and seed membership revenue growth. To make the necessary investment in new services while holding the line on costs to CRL members, it will be necessary for CRL operating fund spending in FY 2017 to exceed operating revenues by a margin of 12.5%.

However, in order to maintain an adequate level of operating reserves and achieve a balanced budget in FY 2020, Mr. Wang pointed out, CRL must begin in FY 2018 to reduce the level of its annual deficit.

Mr. Wang pointed out that projected total Personnel Costs in the Operating Fund (\$4,102,575) will be significantly (12.9%) higher than in current year. The increase will result from an expected (20%) rise in medical insurance premiums, transition of some part-time staff to regular status in FY 2016, and a 4% pool for merit and market increases. (The CRL Human Resources and Compensation Committee recommended the pool amount, based on current industry norms and recent survey data. The increase is due also to the shift of some technical services positions from grant to operating funds, and expansion of CRL’s membership and licensing staff to accommodate growing digital activities and services

Then,

**The Council of Voting Members approved the budget for Fiscal Year 2017 as presented with a 0.52% member cost-share rate.
[MOVED: Janice Welburn; SECONDED: Susan Gibbons;
VOTED: unanimously.]**

ELECTION OF DIRECTORS. Mr. Waugh, Chair of the Nominating Committee, presented a slate of nominees for election to the Board of Directors for three-year terms beginning April 14, 2016, as recommended by the Nominating Committee. Mr. Waugh thanked the members of the Committee: James Grossman, American Historical Association; Sarah Michalak, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill; Janice Welburn, Marquette University; Leslie Weir, University of Ottawa; and Bernard Reilly, CRL. The Chair declared that nominations from the floor were in order. There were no nominations from the floor.

Then,

The Council of Voting Members approved the following slate of nominees to be elected to the Board of Directors for three-year terms beginning at the close of this meeting:

- **Gwen Bird, Dean of Libraries, Simon Fraser University**
- **Tyrone Heath Cannon, Dean, University Libraries, University of San Francisco**

- **Barbara I. Dewey, Dean of University Libraries and Scholarly Communications, Pennsylvania State University**
- **Cheryl Regehr, Provost and Vice-President, University of Toronto**
- **Bradley L. Schaffner, College Librarian and Senior Lecturer, Carleton College**
- **Lars Schoultz, William Rand Kenan, Jr. Professor of Political Science, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill (second term)**
- **Xuemao Wang, Dean and University Librarian, University of Cincinnati Libraries (second term)**

**[MOVED: Mr. Waugh; SECONDED: several Councilors;
VOTED: unanimously.]**

Mr. Waugh encouraged Councilors to submit their suggestions for the Board next year to either the Board chair or to CRL's President, who will present them to the Nominating Committee.

Mr. Waugh reported that the CRL Board elected new officers at their meeting on April 13. The new officers were: (Chair) Scott L. Waugh, Executive Vice Chancellor and Provost, University of California, Los Angeles; (Vice Chair) Janice S. Welburn, Dean of University Libraries, Marquette University; (Secretary) Thomas G. Burish, Provost, University of Notre Dame; and (Treasurer) Xuemao Wang, Dean and University Librarian, University of Cincinnati.

Also, Mr. Waugh acknowledged outgoing Board members Susan Gibbons, University Librarian, Yale University; James Grossman, Executive Director, American Historical Association; and Susan Martin, Provost and Senior Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs, University of Tennessee, Knoxville. Mr. Waugh thanked them for their fine and conscientious service to the Board and to CRL.

CRL PRIMARY SOURCE AWARDS. Martha Hruska, Chair, CRL Collections and Services Policy Committee, presented the primary source awards. Ms. Hruska reported that the Collections and Services Policy Committee reviewed all nominations and identified the top projects in three areas: teaching, research, and access. Ms. Hruska thanked the members of the committee for their work and service: Carmelita Pickett, University of Iowa; Greg Raschke, North Carolina State University; Bradley L. Schaffner, Carleton College; Bryan Skib, University of Michigan; Karla Strieb, Ohio State University; and Caitlin Tillman, University of Toronto. Ms. Hruska noted that the purpose of the awards is to identify and recognize innovative uses of primary source materials. The awardees are:

Primary Source Award for Access

Explore Chicago Collections

Tracy J. Seneca, Digital Services Librarian and Clinical Associate Professor, University of Illinois at Chicago

Nominated by Scott Walter, University Librarian, DePaul University

Primary Source Award for Research

Using Primary Sources: Hands-On Instructional Exercises

Ann Bahde, Rare Books and History of Science Librarian, Special Collections and Archives Research Center, Oregon State University

Nominated by Annelise Sklar, Social Sciences Collection Coordinator, University of California, San Diego

Primary Source Award for Teaching

Memory Bandits: Preserving and Interpreting Knowledges of the Past

Patrick Stawski, Duke University Archivist for Human Rights, David M. Rubenstein Rare Book & Manuscript Library, Duke University

Nominated by Kristina Troost, Department of International & Area Studies, Duke University Libraries

On behalf of the Board of Directors Ms. Hruska congratulated the awardees for their fine projects and thanked all of the other nominators and nominees. Ms. Hruska added that detailed information about each project can be found on CRL's website at <http://www.crl.edu/primary-source-awards>.

Ms. Hruska's presentation can be found at [CRL Council of Voting Members](#)

Mr. Waugh thanked Bernard Reilly and CRL staff for "the good work that has been done over the past year." He also thanked representatives of member libraries for being engaged in CRL and attendees for participating in the business meeting. Mr. Waugh announced that the Collections Forum would begin at 1:00pm.

ATTACHMENT A



Council of Voting Members Meeting (April 14, 2016)

Attendees

INSTITUTION	NAME
University of Alabama	Mildred Jackson
*American Council of Learned Societies	Steven Wheatley
Arizona	Stephen Bosch
Boston College	Sally Wyman
Brigham Young University	Jennifer Paustenbaugh
*University of British Columbia	Ingrid Parent
University of California, Irvine	John Renaud
*University of California, Los Angeles	Scott Waugh
*University of California, Los Angeles	Virginia Steel
University of California, Merced	James Dooley
*University of California, San Diego	Martha Hruska
University of California, San Diego	Heather Smedberg
Carleton College	Bradley Schaffner
*Center for Research Libraries	Bernard Reilly
Center for Research Libraries	Judy Alspach
Center for Research Libraries	Bethany Bates
Center for Research Libraries	Virginia Kerr
Center for Research Libraries	Patrick Lummen
Center for Research Libraries	Raymond Sallay
Center for Research Libraries	James Simon
Center for Research Libraries	Christine Stamison
Center for Research Libraries	Marie Waltz
Center for Research Libraries	Mary Wilke
Center for Research Libraries	Kevin Wilks
Center for Research Libraries	Amy Wood
Center for Research Libraries	Toni Kibort
Center for Research Libraries	Patricia Xia
Center for Research Libraries	Moises Gamez
Center for Research Libraries	Bing Hui
Center for Research Libraries	Teletha Brown

INSTITUTION	NAME
Center for Research Libraries	Yvonne Jefferson
Center for Research Libraries	Constance Jurczyk
Center for Research Libraries	Jack Hanson
*University of Cincinnati	Xuemao Wang
College of William and Mary	Georgie Donovan
Columbia University	Jeff Carroll
University of Connecticut	Patrick Carr
University of Dayton	Fred Jenkins
University of Delaware	Susan Davi
Duke University	Jeff Kosokoff
Florida State University	Julia Zimmerman
Florida State University	Roy Ziegler
University of Florida	Patrick Reakes
Georgia Southern University	Bede Mitchell
University of Houston	Marilyn Myers
University of Illinois at Chicago	Stephen Wiberley
University of Illinois at Chicago	Tracy Seneca
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign	Thomas Teper
Indiana University	Marion Frank-Wilson
University of Iowa	Carmelita Pickett
University of Iowa	John Culshaw
Iowa State University	Beth McNeil
University of Kansas	Judith Emde
Kansas State University	Marcia Stockham
Kenyon College	Amy Badertscher
Loyola University of Chicago	Robert. Seal
Loyola University of Chicago	Fred Barnhart
Macalester College	Teresa Fishel
Macalester College	Katy Gabrio
*Marquette University	Janice Welburn
University of Massachusetts Amherst	Leslie Horner Button
McGill University	Louis Houle
University of Miami	Elizabeth Fish
Miami University of Ohio	Jenny Presnell
Michigan State University	Steven Sowards
University of New Mexico	Mark Emmons
New York Public Library	Denise Hibay
New York University	Angela M. Carreno
The Newberry Library	Alice Schreyer
Northwestern University	Sarah Pritchard
University of Notre Dame	Diane Parr Walker

INSTITUTION

NAME

*University of Notre Dame	Thomas Burish
Ohio State University	Damon Jaggars
Ohio University	Janet Hulm
Olivet Nazarene University	Judson Strain
Olivet Nazarene University	Pam Greenlee
University of Oregon	Mark Watson
Oregon State University	Anne Bahde
Oregon State University	Cheryl Middleton
University of Pennsylvania	Brigitte Burris
University of Pennsylvania	Jon Shaw
Pepperdine University	Mark Roosa
Princeton University	David Magier
Queens University	Heather McMullen
Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey	Krisellen Maloney
Simon Fraser University	Gwen Bird
University of South Florida	Cheryl McCoy
Temple University	Brian Schoolar
University of Tennessee	Molly Royse
University of Tennessee	David P Atkins
Texas A & M University	David Carlson
University of Texas at Austin	Mary Rader
The School of the Art Institute of Chicago	Claire Eike
University of Toronto	Caitlin Tillman
Trinity University	Bea Caraway
Union College	Frances Maloy
University of Utah	Anne Morrow
University of Washington	Linda Di Biase
Wayne State University	Sandy Yee
Western Michigan University	Barbara Cockrell
*Yale University	Susan Gibbons

*

Board of Directors