Executive Summary

The Center for Research Libraries (CRL) conducted an assessment of African newspapers online to determine the extent to which those news sources are available in electronic format to researchers at North American institutions.

An earlier 2012 study undertaken by CRL on current acquisition of print newspapers showed a continuing gradual decline in the number of print newspaper subscriptions held by academic libraries. Many research institutions have moved to online database subscriptions to news aggregators and “e-print” collections; and direct scholars to current news content via the open Web.

CRL’s survey findings suggest that these alternate solutions are insufficient to provide the same degree of support for African studies as newspaper collections have historically afforded. Nor do publishers and electronic aggregators today provide comparable online access to content formerly acquired by libraries in physical form. The present survey highlights the challenges of electronic access to news sources, using Sub-Saharan African news as a case study.

Specifically, CRL sought to determine:

• the extent of online availability of African newspaper sources;
• whether the majority of significant print newspapers were also available online, and extent of coverage;
• whether the paper’s format was replicated through “e-print” offerings; and
• whether African news content was being harvested, aggregated, or otherwise included in commercial and non-commercial news resources.

Key findings:

• Only a fraction of African newspaper titles are currently available online. Of an estimated 1,300 titles in circulation throughout Africa, CRL found only 484 titles with some form of active online presence.
• The number of active online titles varies from region to region, and from country to country. Daily newspapers tend to be more consistently represented online than weekly newspapers.
• Titles considered “significant” papers of record are reasonably well represented online, though the technical sophistication and range of content presented on such sites varies widely.
• Of the 484 identified sites, 74% had implemented search functionality. However, few had implemented advanced search capabilities beyond a simple site search. The presence and ease of searching previously published articles is, as a result, highly variable.
• Electronic facsimiles of the print versions of titles are not widely available for African titles, with only 30% of active sites offering some form of “E-Print” or PDF version of the paper.
• Coverage of African titles is relatively sparse within aggregated databases, especially compared to titles from other world regions.

A large share of news produced in countries in the global South continues to be disseminated in print. Heavy reliance on electronic access and large news packages may not be adequately serving the needs of scholars. Aggregators, in particular, should improve coverage of sub-Saharan Africa to ensure that the range of content from this rich region is available to libraries and scholars worldwide.
African Newspapers Online – a survey of current coverage
February 14, 2013
James Simon and Diane Ryan
Center for Research Libraries

A. Introduction
The Center for Research Libraries (CRL) conducted an assessment of African newspapers online to survey the availability of current news content in electronic format for researchers at North American research institutions.

Through anecdotal and statistical means, CRL periodically tracks subscriptions by CRL member institutions to newspapers—in print, microform, or electronic format—for scholarly use. CRL pays particular attention to international news content, based on CRL’s longstanding interest in providing access to news from developing world areas. CRL provides information to libraries on trends in news collecting, and, where feasible, recommends cooperative approaches to providing coverage to news resources.

For example, a 2012 study undertaken by CRL on current acquisition of print newspapers from Africa under the Library of Congress Cooperative Acquisitions Program (LC-CAP) shows a continuing trend of gradual decline in the numbers of print newspaper subscriptions by LC-CAP participants. At the same time, Library of Congress, facing budget shortfalls, curtailed the number of titles it acquires and preserves on microfilm. See Appendix B for the summary report of this study and recommendations for action.

The reasons given by libraries for reducing print subscriptions are varied and include: declining readership; costs of acquisition; delay in receipt and difficulties in handling/claiming issues; budget cutbacks and space limitations of long-term storage; and many others. Many research institutions have all but abandoned collecting print newspapers in favor of online database subscriptions to news aggregators and “e-print” collections; or simply directing scholars toward current content via the open Web.

Are these alternate solutions sufficient? Do publishers and electronic aggregators today provide comparable online access to content formerly acquired in physical form? In conducting the present survey, CRL sought to examine from a regional perspective the challenges of electronic access to news sources. To further inform the LC-CAP study mentioned above, CRL selected Sub-Saharan Africa as the region of interest for its assessment.

Specifically, CRL sought to determine:
• the overall extent of online availability of African newspapers;
• whether the most significant African titles were represented online, and extent of coverage;
• whether the paper’s print format was replicated online through “e-print” offerings; and
• whether African news content was being harvested, aggregated, or otherwise included in commercial and non-commercial electronic news resources.

B. Survey Methodology

B.1. Title Identification
The survey of online newspapers was implemented between October and December, 2012. CRL staff used the following sources to identify titles for inclusion:
Section B. Methodology

Online Sources:
1. ABYZ News Links (http://www.abyznewslinks.com)
3. BBC News – Country Profiles (http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/country_profiles/default.stm)
5. Kidon Media (http://www.kidon.com)
6. Mediatico (http://www.mediatico.com/)
7. MondoTimes (http://www.mondotimes.com/)
9. Worldpress.org (http://worldpress.org/gateway.htm)

Print Sources:
10. World Press Trends, 2009 (WPT)
12. IREX, Media Sustainability Index (MSI) - Africa (2010)

News aggregations
15. AllAfrica.com
16. Factiva (Dow Jones/ProQuest)
17. LexisNexis Academic

In addition, staff searched specialized references for each country as discovered, such as country portals, embassy sites, and Wikipedia.

B.2. Criteria for Inclusion

Our general criteria for review/inclusion of titles/sites were:

- News produced in-country (rather than by foreign news services)
- News organizations with a known print component (conforming generally to accepted criteria for "newspaper" publications)

We sought to exclude, where noted, sites for press agencies (government-produced or private); other broadcast media sites (TV, radio); news portals drawing from multiple, undefined sources; and exclusively online publications. Such resources, admittedly a significant and growing share of news information disseminated online, might be the subject of subsequent analysis.

In total, the survey encompassed investigation of more than 900 newspaper titles from 48 countries of Sub-Saharan Africa (Northern Africa was not studied). Many websites with links to African newspapers were found to be significantly out of date. For the purposes of the study, “Active Titles” were defined as newspapers listed in current press summaries (unless otherwise discovered to be discontinued); newspapers with recently updated websites; or titles known to be recently acquired by CRL member libraries. World Press Trends statistics (2009) indicate that there are as many as 1300 free and paid-for titles in circulation throughout Africa. Using best available information, CRL staff could confirm approximately 635 active titles.

Results were compiled by CRL staff and organized into a spreadsheet (Appendix A). Titles were organized by region (corresponding to sub-regions of the United Nations geoscheme for Africa) and country. Links were included, where found. Not all defunct titles/links found were included in the final spreadsheet.
C. Survey findings

C.1. Overall coverage of newspapers online

Of the 635 active titles confirmed, 484 titles (or 76%) had some form of current online presence. Figure 1 shows the number of active titles and working links for each country, sorted highest to lowest. Not surprisingly, South Africa topped the list, with 126 active titles identified. Of these, 88 (or 70% of active titles from South Africa) were found to have an online presence.

The percentage of active links versus titles varied widely per country and region. The median number of titles per country was 10, as was the median number of active links.

The high correlation of online presence to active titles should not be interpreted to mean that most African newspapers have an internet presence. As we noted above, the difficulty of identifying current newspapers from Africa meant a heavy reliance on Internet-based sources, which are generally constructed to link to online newspapers. Given that CRL could identify only half as many titles as the 1300 suggested by WPT, it might be posited that as many as two out of three African newspapers have no identified internet presence. Better data on current newspapers is required in order to draw a reliable conclusion.

Figures 2 and 3(below) represent the breakdown of published dailies and non-dailies, respectively, by region. For each region, the figures show the number of titles indicated by World Press Trends as being in circulation; the number of active titles identified by CRL; the number of titles found with active online content; and the number of titles represented in online news aggregations (more on the last column below).
The number of active online titles varies from region to region, country to country. In some cases (as shown in East African dailies, above) CRL identified more titles than was indicated in World Press Trends data, signifying, perhaps incomplete numbers represented in WPT; an increase in titles produced; or both.

The identification of non-daily publications, of which there are many more titles produced, was more problematic. For the titles identified, it can be said that daily newspapers tend to be more consistently represented online through publisher websites. Approximately 84% of identified dailies were found to have an online presence, while non-dailies (including semi-weeklies, weeklies, and less-frequently produced editions) had an average 70% representation online.

World Press Trends provides only summary statistics on all titles published per country, and only selective title information on top-circulating dailies.
When noting an active online presence, staff also took note of whether news sites had search capabilities for articles, including backfile content. Given the scope of the survey and difficulty ascertaining the depth of historical content, a comprehensive survey of backfile coverage was not undertaken. However, of the 484 identified links, approximately 74% of all sites had implemented search functionality for their sites. Most often, it was found that the publishers simply implemented a Google Site Search for their content. Very few had implemented more sophisticated or advanced search capabilities.

C.2. Availability of “significant” newspaper titles online
CRL sought to determine whether the most significant print publications from each country were available online. The determination of what constituted a “significant” publication proved challenging. Staff drew its conclusions for this subset of publications from various indicators:

- highest-circulating dailies and significant non-dailies reported in World Press Trends;
- newspapers collected by LC-CAP in Nairobi and CRL Members;
- titles otherwise characterized as a “paper of record” by various sources (national dailies, state-owned, leading independent capital newspapers, etc).

Of the 200 papers identified as significant titles, nearly 80% were found to have active websites. The range of content included on these sites range widely in terms of coverage of the articles in the print edition. In many
findings, only the top articles appeared to be present, while others featured numerous articles corresponding to the print edition, often broken out into different sections of the website. A random ten percent sampling of titles showed a range from seven current articles to more than 50 articles posted per day (the median being 18 articles). One-to-one comparison to the print versions was impossible, due the limited availability of print supply in the U.S. However, from casual observation, it would appear that no sites included the full range of content that appeared in the comparable print edition (including classifieds, opinion, cartoons, advertisements, obituaries, etc).

Websites of significant publications also varied widely in their technical sophistication. Many used content management systems to host content, from basic templates created in open source systems (e.g., Joomla) to customized in-house solutions. Numerous titles were found to be represented on standard blogging platforms (e.g., Wordpress, OverBlog, others), occasionally with tagging enabled for relevant article sections. Of the active sites, just over 70% had some form of search functionality on their site, consistent with the overall findings above. Many of the top sites also had some form of RSS feed for recent articles, though these were applied inconsistently.

C.3. Availability of E-Print versions of papers

In looking for current coverage, CRL staff noted where publications contained PDF or equivalent “e-print” versions of the newspapers on their site (or in other locations). CRL’s study found that African e-prints were available for approximately 30% of active online titles. While this number was somewhat larger than our initial expectation based on preliminary assessment, it is still a relatively small percentage of all publications.

Figures 4 and 5 (below) show the distribution of e-print availability by region (dailies and non-dailies). Here again, the more robust presence of daily news sites plays out in a greater prevalence of e-print versions of papers.

The availability of this particular format of publication varies significantly by country, with a particularly strong prevalence of e-papers in South Africa (with more than 80% of online titles offering e-print versions of titles). Countries with a high representation of e-paper versions include Malawi (67%), Cape Verde (60%), Uganda (58%), and Kenya (56%). Other countries with comparably strong print media presence—including Tanzania, Zimbabwe, and Mali—have no apparent tradition of offering e-print versions of their papers online.

The format and/or platforms for presenting the facsimile edition are diverse. Some papers post a simple PDF version to their site (or a third-party host) for reading and/or download. These files could theoretically be harvested on a regular schedule. Other publishers host e-paper versions using proprietary page-turning software, preventing easy downloads or advanced uses. Many of the e-print versions are available for subscribers only, requiring registration and payment for access. PressDisplay, a common software service subscribed by U.S. libraries for access to current world news, hosts only a small fraction of online newspapers from Africa—around 35 titles, with large majority of those coming from South Africa.
Despite the relatively low representation of e-papers online, CRL staff found evidence that a number of newspapers may be well-positioned to deliver e-print versions electronically. In reviewing sites, CRL identified an additional 60 titles that presented a facsimile image of the cover page for the most recently-published newspaper. These “page one” images indicate that many publishers produce their print editions in electronic format, exporting PDF or other formats for printing purposes.
C.4. News aggregator coverage of African newspapers
As U.S. and other libraries rely increasingly on large-scale aggregations of news content—usually from commercial suppliers—to supply of current news for researchers, CRL sought to assess to what extent African news content was being harvested, aggregated, or otherwise included in commercial and non-commercial news databases.

Figures 6 and 7 show the coverage of African newspapers (dailies and non-dailies) within some of the largest aggregations of current news content. CRL examined publicly available title lists from three major commercial news providers (Dow Jones Factiva, LexisNexis Academic, and Readex Access World News). CRL also compared content sources listed from AllAfrica.com, a for-profit aggregator of African news content (registered in Mauritius, with offices in Johannesburg, Dakar, Lagos and Washington, D.C.).

![Aggregator coverage - Dailies](image)

Within aggregated databases, coverage for African newspapers—again, excluding press agencies, broadcast organizations, or other online content—is relatively sparse, especially compared to the proportion of other news sources contained in each commercial news aggregation. AllAfrica.com appears to best represent coverage of African newspaper sources, with 127 claimed newspaper titles.

Access World News contains a reported 97 newspapers. LexisNexis follows with 80 listed titles, and Factiva trails with just 28 titles (nearly four fifths coming from South Africa).

---

2 Factiva claims more than 35,000 sources in total, with approximately 5,100 coming from “news” sources (as identified by CRL); LexisNexis includes nearly 5,300 news sources, and AWN 3,800.
In point of fact, however, the numbers represented by aggregators may be misleading, as all three aggregators claim to include AllAfrica.com source content in their product. It is not clear whether aggregators list individual AllAfrica sources—in part or whole—in their title lists, or perhaps include duplicate coverage of titles supplied by AllAfrica. Of the 127 AllAfrica titles, 51 were listed by Access World News and LexisNexis. Only ten titles in common were included in the Factiva list.

As noted above, news aggregators claim thousands of titles on their source lists. However, by comparing aggregator’s publicly available title lists to CRL’s list of active African newspapers, it was found that some titles listed in the products above appear to be no longer active. Aggregators should be encouraged to keep their title lists current, to provide existing and potential subscribers with a more accurate representation of coverage.

In any event, the number of titles included in all four sources appears to be far less than the potential range of content available from African newspaper sources online.
D. Conclusions

Reliable data on African news is particularly challenging to acquire. During the assessment, CRL staff found inconsistencies in the availability of websites (which might be up or down from day to day, with no discernible reason for the breakdown) as well as the currency of news presented. The dataset therefore represents, at best, a snapshot of current coverage during the time of study.

Libraries in the U.S. have long sought to ensure the availability of African news content for research purposes. The ability of libraries to maintain a representative collection of record, however, is increasingly imperiled by the turn to electronic sources to supply access to collections once acquired and maintained in print. In 1999, the number of newspapers currently received by academic libraries and the Library of Congress was reported at more than 500 titles. In 2006, the African Newspapers Union List (AFRINUL)—a Global Resources Network effort administered by CRL to collect holdings information for newspapers published in sub-Saharan Africa—reported more than 775 currently-received titles from the same region of study as the present survey. While a comprehensive survey of current subscriptions has not been undertaken in recent years, informal surveys of library catalogs of major research institutions suggests numerous titles from the 2006 study are no longer currently acquired in print.

In the United States, news publishers have increasingly turned to “Web-first” delivery of news. CRL’s 2011 report “Preserving News in the Digital Environment: Mapping the Newspaper Industry in Transition” demonstrates the changes in the lifecycle of news production by major publishers in the U.S. A related survey of U.S. newspapers in transition (“Who Needs Newspapers?”) suggests news organizations will continue the trend of shaping their services to an electronic audience, surpassing (if not completely eliminating) their print component. The growth of mobile penetration has strongly influenced newspapers’ orientation toward delivering content to mobile devices (tablets, mobile phones, etc). Both reports acknowledge that smaller, community newspapers lag behind industry leaders in making this transition to a Web presence. Most newspapers in the U.S. have some Web component, but many of the smaller sites lack the complex systems to manage and deliver news content to an increasingly diverse and fractionalized audience.

The same challenges face newspapers from less-developed world areas. A large share of news produced in countries in the global South continues to be disseminated in print. Some world regions (Africa, Latin America, Asia Pacific), are seeing substantial growth in print markets, due to rising literacy, employment, and income levels. However, the development of electronic distribution mechanisms continues to fall short of trends in other world areas.

As a result, libraries’ heavy reliance on electronic access and large news packages may not be adequately serving the needs of Africanist scholars. Commercial aggregators, when selecting potential titles for inclusion in news packages, pay particular attention to issues of relevance, balanced coverage, currency of content, consistency of supply, and availability of backfiles. Many African newspapers may fail to meet one or several of these criteria, thus providing justification for the exclusion. Despite this, aggregators should endeavor to take a fresh look at the availability of content from sub-Saharan Africa to ensure that the range of content from this rich region is available to libraries and scholars worldwide.

---

This report does not address particular user needs, and it is important to understand how researchers are discovering and using African news sources in their work. To construct effective preservation strategies we simply need to know more about these uses.
**Appendix A**

**Dataset of African Newspapers online**

Sample of survey fields – full sheet available at:

[http://www.crl.edu/sites/default/files/attachments/tg/Africa%20-%20online%20newspapers%202013-01-25.xlsx](http://www.crl.edu/sites/default/files/attachments/tg/Africa%20-%20online%20newspapers%202013-01-25.xlsx)
Appendix B

2012 African Newspaper Report - AfriCAP subscriptions
(October 2012)

Trends in Subscriptions

We see a continuing trend of gradual decline in the numbers of print newspaper subscriptions. Though not precipitous, there is a consistent slide in the numbers of print copies acquired by participating institutions.

Of the 52 active titles offered through the LC-Nairobi office, 24 titles (46%) saw a reduction in numbers of subscribing members between 2009 and 2012. Only three titles saw a (marginal) increase in subscriptions.

In the aggregate, at least two institutions subscribe to each offered title. The average number of holding libraries is 4 per title. However, if one excludes LC as a subscriber, there are 21 titles (40%) with fewer than three subscribing libraries. Five titles on the have only one subscribing library aside from LC:

- Nation (Blantyre, Malawi)
- Express (Port Louis, Mauritius)
- News on Sunday (Mauritius)
- Soleil (Senegal)
- African (Dar es Salaam, Tanzania)

Of 21 participants studied, eight (38%) decreased the number of subscriptions since the 2009 survey. Most declines were modest in number, with only three institutions cutting 5 or more titles from their profile. Three institutions increased their subscriptions (by one title each).

Northwestern continues to lead in total subscriptions, with 51 subscribed titles. New York Public maintains subscriptions to 44 titles (including several titles not offered through the standard profile). Stanford subscribes to 31 titles.

Microfilming

Nairobi continues to ship titles to the LC field office in New Delhi for preservation microfilming. However, in fiscal year 2012, as a result of funding cuts, LC-N was forced to reduce the number of titles slated for preservation. This resulted in a cut of 21 titles--a large portion of which are not offered through AfriCAP. Nairobi reports that it did not renew print subscription for these titles, eliminating the possibility of retaining backfiles for filming in future funding cycles. LC-Nairobi has indicated that, in theory, it could supply to participants titles to which LC has dropped its own subscription (on a cost basis).

Endangered Titles

We have assembled what might be considered an “endangered species list” for African newspapers. These are titles with low print subscription, ceased microfilming/print subscription by LC, or a combination of factors. We strongly recommend institutions with current subscriptions retain their subscriptions to these titles. Further, any proactive measures to retain backfiles or declare their holdings a “copy of record” would be gratefully received.

Botswana
- Botswana guardian

Cameroon
- Cameroon tribune (English and French)
• Messager (Douala, Cameroon)
• Post (Buea, Cameroon)

Ethiopia
• Daily Monitor (Addis Ababa, Ethiopia)

Kenya
• Coastweek.
• People (Nairobi, Kenya : Daily)
• Taifa leo

Malawi
• Daily times (Blantyre, Malawi)
• Nation (Blantyre, Malawi)

Mauritius
• Express (Port Louis, Mauritius)
• Express dimanche
• News on Sunday.

Namibia
• New era (Windhoek, Namibia)

Senegal
• Soleil (Senegal)
• Sud quotidien.
• Temoin (Dakar, Senegal)
• Wal Fadjri = L'Aurore.

Tanzania
• African (Dar es Salaam, Tanzania)
• Business times.
• Guardian (Tanzania)
• Guardian on Sunday (Dar es Salaam)

Zambia
• Times of Zambia.
• Herald (Harare, Zimbabwe)
• Sunday Mail (Zimbabwe)

Submitted by James Simon, CRL